

*Selected Technical and Economic  
Comparisons of Synfuel Options*

October 1982

NTIS order #PB83-147363

**INCREASED AUTOMOBILE  
FUEL EFFICIENCY AND  
SYNTHETIC FUELS**

Alternatives For Reducing Oil Imports

Background Paper #2

Selected Technical and Economic Comparisons  
of Synfuel Options

October 1982



CONGRESS OF THE UNITED STATES  
Office of Technology Assessment  
Washington, D. C. 20540

## Preface

This volume contains papers written for OTA to assist in preparation of the report ***Increased Automobile Fuel Efficiency and Synthetic Fuels: Alternatives for Reducing Oil Imports***. OTA does not endorse these papers. In several instances, the OTA report reaches somewhat different conclusions because of additional information which was obtained later. These papers, however, may prove valuable for readers needing more detailed or specific information than could be accommodated in the final assessment report, and are being made available for such purposes.

SELECTED TECHNICAL AND ECONOMIC COMPARISONS

OF SYNFUEL OPTIONS

FINAL REPORT

April 1981

Prepared For The  
Office of Technology Assessment  
United States Congress

*E. J. Bentz & Associates Inc.*

7 9 1 5   R i c h f i e l d   R o a d  
S p r i n g f i e l d   V i e t n a m   2 2 1 5 3

## NOTICE

This report was prepared as an account of work sponsored by the Congress of the United States, Office of Technology Assessment. Neither the Congress of the United States nor the Office of Technology Assessment, United States Congress, nor any of its employees, nor any of their contractors, sub-contractors, or their employees, makes any warranty, expressed or implied, or assumes any legal liability or responsibility for the accuracy, completeness, or usefulness of any information, apparatus, product or process disclosed, or represents that its use could not infringe privately owned rights.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY. . . . .	1
TABLE OF CONTENTS. . . . .	i
LIST OF FIGURES . . . . .	iv
LIST OF TABLES . . . . .	v
LIST OF EXHIBITS . . . . .	viii
CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION . . . . .	1-0
1.1 Role of Synthetic Fuels . . . . .	1-1
1.2 Scope of Study . . *. . . . .	<b>1-2</b>
CHAPTER 2: BACKGROUND . . . . . * * . . . . .	2-0
(I) Description of the Coal Conversion and Oil Shale Retorting Fuel Cycles	
2.1 Overview of the Coal and Oil Shale Fuel Cycles . . . . .	2-1
2.2 Coal and Oil Shale Resources. . . . .	<b>2-1</b>
2.3 Exploration and Mining. . . . .	<b>2-6</b>
2.4 Beneficiation . . . . .	<b>2-9</b>
2.5 Transportation. . . . .	2-10
2.6 Conversion. . . . .	2-10
2.7 Upgrading and Refining. . . . .	2-10
2.8 Distribution to End Users . . . . .	2-13
(II) Characteristic Synfuel Technologies Parameters	
2.9 Common Elements . . . . .	2-15
2.10 Physical Size . . . . .	2-15
2.11 Complexity. . . . .	2-15
2.12 costs .. . . .	2-17
2.13 Conversion Efficiency . . . . .	2-18
2.14 Other Requirements and Concerns . . . . .	2-18
CHAPTER 3: OVERVIEW OF SELECTED SYNTHETIC FUEL CONVERSION PROCESSES . . . . . * * . . . . .	3-0
3.1 General Synfuel Processes . . . . .	3-1
3.2 Coal Gasification . . . . .	3-2
3.3 Coal Liquefaction . . . . .	3-8

	<u>Page</u>
3.3. 1 General . . . . .	3-8
3.3. 2 Liquid Solvent Refined Coal (SRCII) . . . . .	3-11
3.3. 3 Exxon Donor Solvent . . . . .	3-14
3.3. 4 H-Coal . . . . . 0 0	3-17
3.3. 5 Fischer-Tropsch Process . . . . .	3-21
3.3. 6 Methanol Process . . . . .	3-26
3.4 Oil Shale Retorting . . . . .	3-31
3.4. 1 General . . . . .	3-31
3.4. 2 Surface Retorting . . . . .	3-31
3.4. 3 Modified In Situ Retorting . . . . .	3-36
3.5 Comparison of the Various Synfuel Systems With Respect to Resource Requirements . . . . .	3-40
CHAPTER 4: SYNTHETIC FUEL PROCESSES CONVERSION COST AND PRODUCT ECONOMICS . . . . .	4-0
4.1 Conversion Costs and Product Economics . . . . .	4-1
4.2 Scale of Production . . . . .	4-7
4.3 product Quality . . . . .	4-8
4.4 Estimating Methods . . . . .	4-11
4.5 product Upgrading . . . . .	4-22
4.6 Refining Synthetic Liquids . . . . .	4-28
4.7 Transportation and Other Infra- structure Costs . . . . .	4-36
4.8 Addendum to Chapter 4: Basis for Cost Assumptions . . . . .	4-43
1. Basic Conversion Plant . . . . .	4-43
2. Assumptions of Product Upgrading . . . . .	4-44
3. Refining Cost Assumptions . . . . .	4-46
CHAPTER 5: SUPPLY DEPLOYMENT SCENARIOS FOR SYNTHETIC FUELS . . . . .	5-0
5.1 Factors and Constraints Affecting Synfuel Development . . . . .	5-1
5.2 Constraining Factors in the Transi- tion period: 1980-2000 . . . . .	5-3

	<u>Page</u>
5.2.1 Equipment Problems . . . . .	5-4
5.2.2 Critical Materials . . . . .	5-6
5.2.3 Manpower . . . . .	5-6
5.2.4 Coal Supply. . . . .	5-9
5.2.5 Water Supply . . . . .	5-13
5.2.6 Environmental Health and Safety . . . . .*	5-13
5.2.7 Siting . . . . .9	5-14
5.2.8 Transportation .. .*	5-15
5.2.9 Tradeoffs. . . . .9	5-15
5.3 Development of Supply Deployment Scenario and Comparisons With Other Estimates . . . . .	5-17
(A) Shale Oil Scenario . . . . .	5-17
(B) Coal Gases Scenario. . . . .	5-23
(c) Coal Liquids . . . . .	5-32
(D) Summary Tables and Compari- sons . . . . .	5-38
5.4 Labor Requirements Associated With the Scenarios . . . . .	5-42
5.4.1 Operations Labor Needs . . . . .	5-42
5.4.2 Construction Labor Needs . . . . .	5-44
5.4.3 Regional Deployment of Synthetic Fuel Plants Work Force. . . . .	5-49
5.5 Additional Concerns and Impacts: Product Acceptability Concerns. . . . .	5-50
5.6 Foot notes to Chapter 5 . . . . .	5-53

APPENDICES

Appendix to Chapter 2: Typical Mining Characteristics. . . . .	A-1
---	-----

Appendix to Chapter 5:

(A) Status of Process Development . . . . .	A-1
(B) Existing U.S. and Foreign <sup>Low</sup> and Medium-Btu Gasification Systems . . . . .	B-1
(C) U.S. DOE Cooperative Agreements and Feasibility Study Grants for Syn- fuels . . . . .	c-1

GLOSSARY . . . . .	G-1
--------------------	-----

BIBLIOGRAPHY . . . . .	B-1
------------------------	-----

LIST OF FIGURES

	<u>Page</u>
Figure 1.1: U.S. Synthetic Fuels Production Goals 1985-2000. . . . .	1-3
Figure 2.1: Coal Conversion System . . . . .	2-2
Figure 2.2: Oil Shale Retorting System . . . . .	2-3
Figure 2.3: Coal Fields of the <sup>conterminous-</sup> United States. . . . .	2-4
Figure 2.4: Oil Shale Deposits of the United States. . . . .	2-5
Figure 2.5: Crude Oil Pipeline Network . . . . .	2-14
Figure 3.1: Basic Coal Gasification Processes. . . . .	3-4
Figure 3.2: Schematic Diagram of Coal Gasification .	3-5
Figure 3.3: Schematic Diagram of the Basic Liquefaction Processes . . . . .	3-10
Figure 3.4: Schematic Diagram of the Solid Refined Coal (SRC-II) Process. . . . .	3-12
Figure 3.5: Schematic Diagram of the Donor Solvent Liquefaction Process . . . . .	3-16
Figure 3.6: Schematic Diagram of the H-Coal Process. . . . .	3-20
Figure 3.7: Fischer-Tropsch Synthesis. . . . .	3-25
Figure 3.8: Synthesized Gasoline From Coal . . . . .	3-27
Figure 3.9: Mobil Catalytic Process. . . . .	3-28
Figure 3.10: The TOSCO II Oil Shale Retorting System . . . . .	3-32
Figure 3.11: Modified In Situ Retorting . . . . .	3-37
Figure 3.12: Occidental Modified In Situ Retorting. .	3-38
Figure 5.1: Comparison of Synthetic Fuel Production Estimates. . . . .	5-41



LIST OF TABLES

	<u>Page</u>
Table 2.1: U.S. by States--Resources-Reserve Base-Production--Bituminous- Subbituminous-Lignite Coal. . . . .	2-7
Table 2.2 : Potential Shale Oil in Place in the Oil Shale Deposits of the United States .	2-8
Table 2.3 : Process Summary . . . . .	2-19
Table 3.1: Solvent Refined Coal II (SRC-II) . . . . .	3-13
Table 3.2: Typical Properties of SRC Fuels Using Recycle SRC Process . . . . .	3-15
Table 3*3: Donor Solvent Product Analysis. . . . .	3-18
Table 3.4: Estimated Heat Balance for a Commercial- Scale EDS Plant . . . . .	3-19
Table 3.5 : Properties of H-Coal Distillates From Illinois No. 6 Coal Liquids . . . . .	3-22
Table 3.6 : H-Coal. . . . .	3-23
Table 3.7: Overviews of SASOL I and SASOL 11 . . . . .	3-24
Table 3.8: Thermal Efficiencies--Methanol-to- Gasoline --Fischer-Tropsch . . . . .	3-29
Table 3.9: Methanol-to-Gasoline Balances . . . . .	3-30
Table 3 .10: Basic Material Balance for a TOSCO II Retort Module . . . . .	3-33
Table 3 .11: Estimated Energy Balance for a TOSCO II Plant. . . . .	3-34
Table 3 .12: TOSCO II Oil Shale Retorting. . . . .	3-35
Table 3 .13: Modified In Situ Shale Retorting (Occidental). . . . .	3-39
Table 3 .14: Resource Utilization Efficiencies of Synthetic Fuel Energy Systems . . . . .	3-41
Table 3 .15: Fossil Carbon Consumption of Synthetic Fuel Energy Systems . . . . .	3-43

	<u>Page</u>
Table 3.16 :	Water Consumption of Synthetic Fuel Energy Systems. . . . . 3-44
Table 3.17 :	Manpower Requirements of Synfuel Energy Systems. . . . . 3-46
Table 3.18:	Annual Feedstock Requirements for Synthetic Fuel Energy Systems .... . 3-48
Table 3.19 :	Annual Water Consumption of Synthetic Fuel Energy Systems ..... . 3-49
Table 3.20:	Annual Manpower Requirements of Synthetic Fuel Energy Systems " ... . 3-50
Table 5.1:	Potentially Commercial Scale Projects-- Shale Oil .. " ..... . 5-18
Table 5.2 :	Shale Oil Build-up Scenarios" .... . 5-20
Table 5.3:	Shale Oil Deployment Scenarios (and Comparisons). . . . . 5-21
Table 5.4:	Estimated Typical Shale Oil product Slate 1980-2000 (For Scenarios) . . . . . 5-22
Table 5.5:	Potential Commercial Scale Projects-- Low\Med Btu Gas . . . . . 5-25
Table 5.6 :	Potential Commercial Scale Projects-- H-Btu Gas . . . . . 5-28
Table 5.7:	Scenario Deployment: H-Btu and Med\Low Btu Gas . . . . . 5-30
Table 5.8:	Synthetic Coal Gases Comparison . . . . . 5-31
Table 5.9:	Potential Commercial Scale Projects-- Coal Liquids. . . . . * * . . . . 5-34
Table 5.10 :	Coal Liquids Build-up Rate Scenario: Indirect and Direct . .0. .*** . . . 5-35
Table 5.11:	Coal Liquids Build-up Rate Scenarios. . . . . 5-36
Table 5.12:	Coal Liquids Comparisons. . . . . 5-37
Table 5.13 :	Summed Synthetic Fuel Deployment Schedules . . . . . .... . 5-39

	<u>Page</u>
Table 5 .14: Comparison of Synthetic Fuel Production Estimates . . . . .	5-40
Table 5 .15: Aggregate Operations Labor Needs. . . . .	5-43
Table 5 .16: Direct Coal Liquids--Incremental Construction Labor Requirements for Plants Coming On-Line in Period Ending. . . . .	5-45
Table 5.17: Indirect Coal Liquids--Incremental Construction Labor Requirements for Plants Coming On-Line in Period Ending. . . . .	5-46
Table 5.18: Shale Oil--Incremental Construction Labor Requirements for Plants Coming On-Line in Period Ending. . . . .	5-47
Table 5.19: Coal Gases--Incremental Construction Labor Requirements for Plants Coming On-Line in Period Ending. . . . .	5-48
Table 5.20: Regional Share of Incremental Con- struction Work Force for Plants Coming On-Line in Period Ending . . . . .	5-49

LIST OF EXHIBITS

	Page
Exhibit 4-1: Plant Capital Requirements . . . . .	4-3
Exhibit 4-2: Total Conversion Plant Investment . . . . .	4-4
Exhibit 4-3: Cost Data--Operating and Maintenance cost . . . . .	4-5
Exhibit 4-4: Annual Operating Cost . . . . .	4-6
Exhibit 4-5: Synthetic Plant Product Yields . . . . .	4-10
Exhibit 4-6: Synthetic Fuel Production Costs Original Estimates - Raw Liquids . . . . .	4-12
Exhibit 4-7: Cost Growth in Pioneer Energy Process Plants . . . . .	4-14
Exhibit 4-8: History of Shale Oil Capital Cost Estimates . . . . .	4-15
Exhibit 4-9: Synthetic Fuels Production Costs, Factored Cost Estimates, Raw Liquids . . . . .	4-17
Exhibit 4-10: Best Available Estimates - Typical Synfuel Processes . . . . .	4-18
Exhibit 4-11: Synthetic Fuels production Costs Factored Cost Estimates, Raw Liquids, Best Estimates . . . . .	4-21
Exhibit 4-12: Simplified Flow Diagram of Chevron First State Hydrotreater Refining of SRC-II Oil . . . . .	4-23
Exhibit 4-13: Direct Liquids Upgrading Costs . . . . .	4-25
Exhibit 4-14: Direct Liquids Upgraded Costs/Barrel . . . . .	4-27
Exhibit 4-15: Synthetic Fuels Production costs, Best Available Estimates, Upgraded Liquids . . . . .*	4-29
Exhibit 4-16: Process and Slate . . . . .	4-31
Exhibit 4-17: Synthetic Fuels Production Costs, Best Available Cost Estimates - Refined Liquid Fuels . . . . .	4-33

	Page
Exhibit 4-18: Direct Liquids (SRC-II) Refining . . . .	4-34
Exhibit 4-19: SRC II Refined To Product Costs . . . .	4-35
Exhibit 4-20: Synthetic Fuel Liquids . . . . .	4-37
Exhibit 4-21: Schematic Flow Diagram--Refining of SRC-II Oil by Hydrotreating and Hydrocracking--Case I . . . . .	4-38
Exhibit 4-22: Schematic Flow Diagram--Refining of SRC-II Oil by High Severity Hydrotreating--Case II . . . . .	4-39
Exhibit 4-23: Simplified Flow Diagram--Refining of SRC-II Oil by Moderate Severity Hydrotreating--Case III . . . . .	4-40
Exhibit 5.1: Potentially Critical Materials and Equipment Requirements for Coal Liquids Plants and Associated Mines. . . .	5-7
Exhibit 5.2: Selected Material and Equipment Items Required . . . . .	5-8
Exhibit 5.3: Total Engineering Manpower Require- ments for Coal Liquids Plants and Associated Mines . . . . .	5-10
Exhibit 5.4: Projected Peak Construction Labor Requirements . . . . .	5-11
Exhibit 5.5: Regional Manual Labor for Construction and Maintenance for Coal Liquids Plants and Associated Mines . . . . .	5-12
Exhibit 5.6: Tradeoffs in Shale Development . . . . .	5-16